RFP 19-010
Professional Auditing Services for the City of Marco Island, Florida

Firm

Caballero Fierman Llerena Garcia

	Dick Adams	Robert Hughes	Jim Karter	Jim Miller	William Rogers	Bill Schroeder
	Score	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*
Ability and experience of the assigned personnel	20	20		18	18	18
Max Points **25**						
Experience of the firm	20	20		18	15	18
Max Points **25**						
Ability to furnish required services	20	15		17	15	15
Max Points **25**						
Total compensation proposed	20	21		22	24	23
Max Points **25**						
Totals	80	76	0	75	72	74

Total points
377

Firm

Carr Riggs&Ingram

	Dick Adams	Robert Hughes	Jim Karter	Jim Miller	William Rogers	Bill Schroeder
	Score	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*
Ability and experience of the assigned personnel	15	22		18	19	18
Max Points **25**						
Experience of the firm	25	21		20	22	20
Max Points **25**						
Ability to furnish required services	25	22		19	22	20
Max Points **25**						
Total compensation proposed	20	20		18	20	20
Max Points **25**						
Totals	85	85	0	75	83	78

Total points
406

Firm

Cherry Bekaert

	Dick Adams	Robert Hughes	Jim Karter	Jim Miller	William Rogers	Bill Schroeder
	Score	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*
Ability and experience of the assigned personnel	15	23		20	25	18
Max Points **25**						
Experience of the firm	20	23		19	24	20
Max Points **25**						
Ability to furnish required services	20	22		20	24	20
Max Points **25**						
Total compensation proposed	20	19		15	20	15
Max Points **25**						
Totals	75	87	0	74	93	73

Total points
402

Firm

Christopher Smith Leonard Bristow&Stanell

	Dick Adams	Robert Hughes	Jim Karter	Jim Miller	William Rogers	Bill Schroeder
	Score	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*
Ability and experience of the assigned personnel	25	20		20	18	20
Max Points **25**						
Experience of the firm	15	21		18	18	20
Max Points **25**						
Ability to furnish required services	15	19		19	17	15
Max Points **25**						
Total compensation proposed	20	20		16	22	17
Max Points **25**						
Totals	75	80	0	73	75	72

Total points
375

Firm

Clifton Larson Allen

	Dick Adams	Robert Hughes	Jim Karter	Jim Miller	William Rogers	Bill Schroeder
	Score	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*
Ability and experience of the assigned personnel	20	22		20	15	23
Max Points **25**						
Experience of the firm	20	23		16	20	25
Max Points **25**						
Ability to furnish required services	20	22		20	20	25
Max Points **25**						
Total compensation proposed	20	21		17	20	19
Max Points **25**						
Totals	80	88	0	73	75	92

Total points
408

Firm

Keefe McCullough

	Dick Adams	Robert Hughes	Jim Karter	Jim Miller	William Rogers	Bill Schroeder
	Score	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*
Ability and experience of the assigned personnel	15	22		15	20	20
Max Points **25**						
Experience of the firm	25	23		18	20	20
Max Points **25**						
Ability to furnish required services	15	22		15	23	20
Max Points **25**						
Total compensation proposed	25	22		24	25	25
Max Points **25**						
Totals	80	89	0	72	88	85

Total points
414

Firm

Mauldin & Jenkins

	Dick Adams	Robert Hughes	Jim Karter	Jim Miller	William Rogers	Bill Schroeder
	Score	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*
Ability and experience of the assigned personnel	25	23		20	23	23
Max Points **25**						
Experience of the firm	25	22		20	24	25
Max Points **25**						
Ability to furnish required services	25	22		19	24	25
Max Points **25**						
Total compensation proposed	20	19		15	21	19
Max Points **25**						
Totals	95	86	0	74	92	92

Total points
439

Firm

Moore Stephens Lovelace

	Dick Adams	Robert Hughes	Jim Karter	Jim Miller	William Rogers	Bill Schroeder
	Score	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*	*Score*
Ability and experience of the assigned personnel	20	22		22	24	18
Max Points **25**						
Experience of the firm	25	20		20	24	20
Max Points **25**						
Ability to furnish required services	20	22		20	23	20
Max Points **25**						
Total compensation proposed	20	20		20	20	22
Max Points **25**						
Totals	85	84	0	82	91	80

Total points
422

Recorded by: Lina Upham, Purchasing & Risk Mngr/Dept City Clerk L. Upham Guillermo Polanco, Finance Director

Date: 4-25-2019

Member Karter was absent.
LU
4.25.19

Final scoring 19-010

	Dick Adams	Robert Hughes	Jim Karter	Jim Miller	William Rogers	Bill Schroeder		Total points	Rank
Caballero Fierman Llerena Garcia	80	76	0	75	72	74		377	7
Carr Riggs&Ingram	85	85	0	75	83	78		406	5
Cherry Bekaert	75	87	0	74	93	73		402	6
Christopher Smith Leonard Bristow&Stanell	75	80	0	73	75	72		375	8
Clifton Larson Allen	80	88	0	73	75	92		408	4
Keefe McCullough	80	89	0	72	88	85		414	3
Mauldin & Jenkins	95	86	0	74	92	92		439	1
Moore Stephens Lovelace	85	84	0	82	91	80		422	2